



IL FALSO

Fakes in the art market

International research workshop

Alma Mater Studiorum
University of Bologna

University of Bologna Institute of Advanced Studies (ISA)

Department of Statistical Sciences “Paolo Fortunati”

Department of the Arts

21 June 2021

Online

Part of the
ISA Topic 2020 – “Il falso” Project
“Art of fake, fake in art and in the art market”

Updated information about the workshop can be found at:
<http://artmarketfakesworkshop.wordpress.com/>

This template originates from LaTeXTemplates.com and is based on the original version at:
https://github.com/maximelucas/AMCOS_booklet

Timetable

S: Session; KS: Keynote Speaker; R: Roundtable

Monday, 21 of June

9:00–9:15		Welcome remarks	
9:15–10:30	S	Session 1 Economics and law	Art frauds: social sciences and law perspectives
10:30–11:00	KS	Elisabetta Lazzaro University for the Creative Arts London	From analogue to digital art market: Some economic implications of copies and fakes
11:00–11:15		Coffee	
11:15–13:00	S	Session 2 Art history	Forgery across centuries and arts
13:00–14:00		Lunch	
14:00–14:30	KS	Anne-Sophie Radermecker EUR Rotterdam & ULB Bruxelles	Revisiting the Early Modern Economics of “Fakes”: A Historiographical Perspective
14:30–16:00	S	Session 3 Scientific tools	Detecting forgery: scientific approaches
16:00–16:15		Coffee	
16:15–16:45	KS	Naomi Oosterman EUR Rotterdam	“Deauthenticating” cultural objects: The use of forgeries and replicas for the trafficking of cultural objects
16:45–17:45	R	Roundtable	Keeping track of art market fakes: can different sources be integrated?
17:45–18:00		Final remarks and future projects	

All timing is listed in CEST

Detailed programme

First Session - Art frauds: social sciences and law perspectives (9:15 - 10:30)

**Attribution Stigma and Contagion:
How did the art auction market react to Australian 'Black art scandals'?**

Tim R.L. Fry¹, Erica Coslor²

S

¹ School of Economics, Finance and Marketing, RMIT University, AU

² Department of Management and Marketing, The University of Melbourne, AU

**From Fortunes to Fakes:
Forgeries that Created an Awareness in the Art Market**

Saskia Hufnagel

S

School of Law, Queen Mary University of London, UK

The impact of changes in attribution on returns

Elena Stepanova

S

Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna, Pisa, IT

Fighting fakes and forgeries to protect the legitimate interests, of whom?

Anna Pirri Valentini

S

LUISS Guido Carli, Rome, IT

Keynote Speaker (10:30 - 11:00)

From analogue to digital art market: Some economic implications of copies and fakes

Elisabetta Lazzaro

KS

Business School for the Creative Industries, University for the Creative Arts, UK

Copies and fakes have attracted the attention of cultural economists as they further challenge the concept of value of a commodity – art – that is complex to assess, in particular from a market perspective, for the multiple dimensions that characterise it, which go beyond the economic realm, encompassing many disciplines, from art, aesthetics, art history, technology, to law, sociology, psychology, anthropology, etc. Nowadays, digital technology, which has penetrated also the art world, seems to expand, and possibly complicate, the ways art can be conceived, created, distributed, accessed, collected, preserved, sold and hence valued on the market. To some extent, digitisation is bringing art back to a main technical dimension (*τέχνη*), at the same time depriving art of its materiality. The utmost stage of the digital art market is represented by tokenised art, which crucially questions key issues of, among others, authenticity, scarcity, ownership and trading. In this paper I consider these issues by drawing a parallel between the emerged digital art market and the traditional, or “analogue”, art market, where the concepts of original, copy and fake, and their relative market value, are central. I discuss how these issues are especially technologically induced, but also financially (speculatively), competitively and socially.

Second session - Forgery across centuries and arts (11:15 - 13:00)

“The Man in the Gold Helmet”: Bode’s restored “Rembrandt”

Dorothee Wimmer

S

Forum Kunst und Markt / Centre for Art Market Studies, Technische Universität Berlin, DE

Fakes in the Art Market: the case of pre-Columbian arts

Ninon Bour

S

ArchAm UMR 8096, Panthéon-Sorbonne University, Paris, FR

Fake to Boot: Forgeries of Russian Avant-Garde on the Italian Peninsula

Konstantin Akinsha

S

Russian Avant-Garde Research Project, UK

Giovanni Bastianini in the Making: an Iconographic Account

Virginia Magnaghi

S

Scuola Normale Superiore, Pisa, IT

Faking copies? Counterfeits and disloyal production of plaster casts in the Atelier de Moulage du Musée du Louvre under the direction of Eugène Arrondelle (1880-1907)

Milena Gallipoli

S

Universidad Nacional de San Martín, AR

Detection & Predictability: Fakes & the Florentine Dealer Stefano Bardini

Lynn Catterson

S

Columbia University, NY, US

Keynote Speaker (14:00 - 14:30)

Revisiting the Early Modern Economics of “Fakes”: A Historiographical Perspective

Anne-Sophie Radermecker

KS

Erasmus University Rotterdam, NL
Université Libre de Bruxelles, BE

What Thierry Lenain calls a “modern obsession” has durably shaped both the history and historiography of art forgery. While the former is relatively well-documented for the 20th century, art historians’ understanding of this practice for older periods relies on a limited number of written sources. That is particularly the case when the 15th and 16th centuries are concerned. Long based on a patronage logic, the Early modern art market and its main archival records provide little economic insight into this practice. As a result, only a handful of anecdotes are traditionally presented as early testimonies of the history of fakes, Michelangelo’s *Cupid* being notoriously acknowledged as one of the most compelling. Based on that observation, this paper will be structured as follows: Firstly, I shall provide an overview of the art market in the Early modern period, whose unique production setting and free interpretation of authorship still have consequences on today’s art market. Secondly, I shall introduce a couple of anecdotes viewed as the foundations of the history of fakes, and through a particular case study (*la tazza de porfido all’antica* by Pier Pietro Maria Serbaldi della Pescia), I shall demonstrate the extent to which the *a posteriori* interpretation of lacunar sources has led historiographers to draw quick conclusions about the practice of art forgery in the Early modern period. The paper will conclude by highlighting the epistemological and methodological challenges faced by art historians when writing the economic history of fakes and by stressing the importance of collaborative research to avoid historiographical bias.

Third Session - Detecting forgery: scientific approaches (14:30 - 16:00)

Using science to unmask fake Order of the Cincinnati decoration on Chinese export porcelain

Shirley M. Mueller

S

Indiana University, IN, US

The Forger's identikit: a multi-technique approach to detect fakes on art market based on Pippo Oriani's case study

*Chiara Manfredi*¹, *Gilda Guerisoli*², *Ludovica Ruggiero*³, *Chiara Lucarelli*⁴,
*Luca Tortora*⁴, *Stefano Ridolfi*⁵, *Giuliana Calcani*⁶, *Armida Sodo*³

S

¹ Dipartimento DAGRI, Università degli Studi di Firenze, IT

² Comando CC TPC, Rome, IT

³ Dipartimento di Scienze, Università degli Studi di Roma Tre, IT

⁴ Laboratorio Analisi Superfici, INFN-Università degli Studi di Roma Tre, IT

⁵ Ars Mensurae, IT

⁶ Laboratorio del Falso, Dipartimento di Studi Umanistici, Università degli Studi di Roma Tre, IT

Artistic forgery in Portugal and its relationship with laboratory expertise

Diana de Almeida Ramos

S

Faculty of Fine Arts, University of Lisbon, PT

Developing rigorous protocols of authentication: the future of science and AI

Denis Moiseev

S

Hephaestus Analytical, UK

Establishing proof of forgery in varying contexts: the challenge of the historian of art technology

Jilleen Nadolny

S

ArtDiscovery, London, UK

Keynote Speaker (16:15 - 16:45)

“Deauthenticating” cultural objects: The use of forgeries and replicas for the trafficking of cultural objects

Naomi Oosterman

KS

Erasmus University Rotterdam, NL
Centre for Global Heritage and Development, NL

When talking about art forgery, our minds tend to wander to examples of seemingly ‘Hollywood-scripted’ events in history: Han van Meegeren successfully duping Nazi-leader Hermann Göring, or Wolfgang Beltracchi’s talent for forging the styles of Max Ernst and Kees van Dongen, subsequently earning him millions. However, we rarely think about the influence of forgeries when they are actively used to conceal other crimes, especially that of the illicit trafficking of cultural objects.

Due to the transnational nature of trafficking cultural objects, the first line of defense for this crime are often national customs agencies. However, customs agents have tremendous difficulties in determining cultural object’s authenticity and their eligibility of being shipped internationally. This difficulty has been further increased by the fact that smugglers have been using replicas and forgeries, together with authentic objects, to masquerade the illicit trafficking of cultural objects. Forgeries and replicas, rather than being examples of ‘crime’ on their own account, now function as objects with the agency of “deauthenticating” authentic objects.

This keynote will examine this phenomenon and will discuss, exemplified with case studies from India and the United States, how replicas are used to successfully traffic cultural objects. It will discuss the role of international law enforcement, regulatory agencies in the art market, and will consider how replicas and forgeries are used to diminish the cultural and economic value of the authentic object by labelling these as ‘novelty items’.

Roundtable (16:45 - 17:45)

Keeping track of art market fakes: can different sources be integrated?

*Andrea Bacchi*¹, *Francesca Marini*², *Raffaella Morselli*³, *Maria Cristina Paoluzzi*⁴, *Carme Ruiz*⁵ 

¹ Fondazione Zeri and Università di Bologna, IT

² International Studies Institute (ISI), Florence, IT

³ Università di Teramo, IT

⁴ Dorotheum, Vienna, AT and Rome, IT

⁵ Fundació Gala-Salvador Dalí, ES

The roundtable will feature the presentation of the permanent and continuously updated multi-media database on art fakes, including text, images, movies, critical analyses, bibliography, etc., curated by Professors Donatella Biagi Maino and Giuseppe Maino.

During the roundtable, invited experts, practitioners, and scholars will discuss the different sources of information about art market fakes and how to integrate them to improve existing policies, and to develop new ones, in coping with fakes in the art market.

Useful Information

All talks will be delivered through the videoconferencing platform Zoom, free to use if you are one of the participant. An updated version of the software is needed to be able to attend the workshop. For information about the software, see <https://support.zoom.us/>

The participation to the workshop is free of charge, and the registration form is available here: <https://forms.gle/9gHAj pz4s8hrFgs3A>

The time indicated in the programme is the CEST time (the time zone of Bologna).

The workshop will be **recorded**, and the video recording will be part of the database presented during the roundtable.

About

The workshop

Fakes and forgeries are items that characterized the art sector since the birth of the art market. Artwork copies, fakes and forgeries (almost) freely circulate in the art market and affect the way price is formed, the way the discourse on artists takes place, and the way art market institutions and agents choose their strategies. This effect consists in an increase of the uncertainty about the authenticity value of the artworks, a value which is part of the cultural value, that in turn affects the artworks' economic value. This makes the existence of fakes an important issue, which should be analysed with an interdisciplinary view. Art market scholars, including economists, art historians, sociologists, management and marketing scholars, historians, among the others, analysed the influence of fakes in the market under different points of view, but the need to link together these views in a holistic analysis of the issue of fakes in the art market is now necessary.

This workshop wants to be a way to start this process of creation of an interdisciplinary framework of analysis of the art market fakes, welcoming approaches and arguments of different academic fields, so as to enucleate the differences and similarities in the approaches used.

For more information about the project, see http://bit.ly/fakes_workshop

The workshop is part of the ISA Topic 2020 "Il Falso", organized by the **Institute for Advanced Studies (ISA) of the University of Bologna** - <http://www.isa.unibo.it/en>

For further information about the workshop and the project, see also <https://artmarketfakesworkshop.wordpress.com/>
or contact `francesco [dot] angelini7 [at] unibo [dot] it`

Organizing committee

Massimiliano Castellani	Department of Statistical Sciences "Paolo Fortunati" - University of Bologna, IT
Donatella Biagi Maino	Department of Arts - University of Bologna, IT
Giuseppe Maino	New York Academy of Sciences, USA
Lorenzo Zirulia	Department of Economics, Management and Quantitative Methods - University of Milan, IT
Francesco Angelini	Department of Statistical Sciences "Paolo Fortunati" - University of Bologna, IT

